

**All comments are relative to draft-ietf-ips-iscsi-16.pdf**

#	Type	Section	Paragraph	Page	Comment
1	T	4.3.1	last	73	The use of MUST in the final sentence is untestable and should probably be lower-case “should”
2	T	9.16.5	2 <sup>nd</sup>	195	“has to” → “MUST”?
3	E	1.1	Portal Group Tag	18	“identifies the” → “identifies a” since there are multiple groups
4	E	1.2	ITN	22	The definition given here disagrees with the one used in section 9.13.5
5	E	2.2.3	3 <sup>rd</sup> on page	33	To help introduce the concept of phases, suggest changing “the initiator may” to something like “the session transitions to Full Feature Phase and the initiator may”
6	E	2.2.4.2	last on page	35	The 1 <sup>st</sup> sentence of this paragraph may mislead the reader because it appears to enumerate all possible initiator choices but doesn’t; e.g. it doesn’t cover the case of immediate data followed by an unsolicited sequence, or the case where the actual data length < FirstBurstLength. It might be simplest to omit the 1 <sup>st</sup> sentence altogether
7	E	2.2.4.3	1 <sup>st</sup> on page	37	“values are” → “values that are”
8	E	2.4.1	last on page	47	“Section Section”
9	E	2.5	2 <sup>nd</sup>	52	Clarity: suggest “may each be followed” instead of “may be followed”
10	E	2.5.1.2	2 <sup>nd</sup>	52	Suggest changing “and an” to “an”
11	E	2.5.1.5	3 <sup>rd</sup>	54	Terminology: the phrase “a complete payload” is incorrect here, e.g. a payload is part of a PDU as mentioned in an earlier paragraph. Suggest simply omitting the phrase
12	E	2.5.1.6	2 <sup>nd</sup>	55	Clarity: suggest changing the start of the 1 <sup>st</sup> sentence: “To help the SCSI target associate resulting Data-out with an R2T, the R2T carries a Target Transfer Tag that will be copied...”
13	E	2.5.3.1	top of page	56	Unreadable English. Perhaps something like “In the data segment, Text Requests/Responses carry text information using a simple ‘key=value’ syntax”

#	Type	Section	Paragraph	Page	Comment
14	E	2.5.3.2	3 <sup>rd</sup> on page	57	“Status counting” → “Status counting (StatSN)”
15	E	4.1	base64-constant	63	Should “(encoded a A)” be “(encoded as A)”?
16	E	4.1	regular-binary-value	64	Missing article: “is implicit” → “is the implicit”
17	E	4.1	large-binary-value	64	Missing article: “is implicit” → “is the implicit”
18	E	4.2	last on page	64	This is still not an English sentence; missing something after “respectively”
19	E	4.3	last on page	69	It would help the reader to explicitly reference CSG and NSG instead of the euphemism “a field that indicates the negotiation stage”
20	E	4.4	2 <sup>nd</sup>	77	Consistency: “Text request” is capitalized here but not, for example, in the 3 <sup>rd</sup> paragraph
21	E	4.4	2 <sup>nd</sup> from last	78	Spelling: “TargetAddress” → “TargetAddress”
22	E	5.4.1	1 <sup>st</sup>	84	Grammar: perhaps “informing of the fact” → “informing the end points of the fact”?
23	E	5.7	last bullet on page	86	Punctuation: “PDU or, reject” → “PDU or reject”
24	E	5.8	1 <sup>st</sup> on page	88	Suggest “interested” → “relevant”, or omit “interested” altogether
25	E	6.1.2	T7	99	“evens” → “events”
26	E	7.2.1	2 <sup>nd</sup>	117	“128 bits” → “128 bit”
27	E	8.1.2	2 <sup>nd</sup>	122	“Section Section”
28		8.1.3	3 <sup>rd</sup>	124	“SCSI will recovery will” → “SCSI recovery will”
29	E	9.3.6	1 <sup>st</sup>	137	The last sentence (“These data are governed...”) still isn’t useful. There aren’t ‘general’ rules; immediate data is treated differently than an unsolicited sequence. It would be more useful to refer to the sections defining the rules for immediate and unsolicited data.
30	T	9.3.6	1 <sup>st</sup>	137	This might be the place to define the implied Buffer Offset value for immediate data.
31	E	9.5.6	1 <sup>st</sup>	149	Punctuation: omit comma after “retransmitted PDUs”

#	Type	Section	Paragraph	Page	Comment
32	E	9.6.2	last; bullet 'b'	152	"responded" → "responded to"
33	E	9.7.4	heading	156	Suggest changing heading to "Target Transfer Tag and LUN" since both are covered
34	E	9.13.5	Code 0101	182	The definition of "ITN" disagrees with that in 1.2; occurs multiple times in this table
35	E	9.17.1	3 <sup>rd</sup> on page	198	Grammar: the parenthetical phrase in the last sentence isn't comprehensible; how about "(the command PDU did not contain all the data and the target has not received a Data-out PDU with the Final bit 1 either for unsolicited data or for all outstanding R2Ts)"?
36	E	9.18	1 <sup>st</sup> and 3 <sup>rd</sup> on page	200	These paragraphs deal in detail with ITT; it would be better to move them into 9.18.1
37	E	B.3	1 <sup>st</sup> after table	241	Spelling: "sequential" → "sequentially"
38	E	D	A SendTargets response...	254	"MUST NOT not" → "MUST NOT"
39	E	F.1	1 <sup>st</sup> on page	277	"for ex." → "for example" or "e.g."